



www.mtclimatechange.us

DRAFT MEETING SUMMARY
Montana Climate Change Advisory Committee
Agriculture, Forestry & Waste Management
Technical Work Group
Call #11, May 25, 2007

Attendance:

1. TWG Members: Ted Dodge, Trudy Peterson, Lowell Whitney, Collin Waters, Richard Liebert, Robert Boettcher
2. Public: None
3. CCS: Steve Roe, Katie Bickel
4. DEQ: Lou Moore, Jim Boyer, Lisa Peterson, Bob Habeck, Bill Bahr

Background documents:

(all posted at http://www.mtclimatechange.us/Agriculture_Forestry.cfm)

1. Agenda
2. Draft Summary of AFW TWG Call#10
3. Power Point Presentation to the AFW TWG
4. MT AFW Policy Options (distributed by email)

Discussion and conclusions:

1. CCS Reviewed the Agenda and Call #10 Summary. No changes were necessary.
2. CCS reviewed additional updates to the forest inventory. USFS provided an updated set of estimates for MT taking into account new FIA data, which show a smaller increase in forest area for MT over time. Prior to receiving the USFS updates, CCS contacted experts at the Ogden Research Station who could not provide any additional information on forest area change data for MT. A TWG member indicated that this seems like the best we can do at this time and that CCS has tracked down as much additional information as is available. The TWG member requested CCS clearly explain the updates in the I&F text and note the uncertainty in the estimates. CCS pointed the TWG to existing text under the uncertainty section of the forestry appendix.
3. One TWG member asked for a legislation update (the legislation session has just been completed). DEQ will provide within the next two weeks.
4. CCS reviewed the policy options document, noting updates to the summary table and progress made on quantification.
5. AFW-1: Additional information added on organic farming. Estimates reflect conservation tillage portion of the goals. Rationale for not estimating the GHG impacts of organic farming has been added.

www.mtclimatechange.us

6. AFW-2/AFW-3: No new information has been added. CCS hopes to include in these options a couple of tables that show the production schedules and assumptions behind the feedstock estimates.
7. A TWG member suggested refining AFW-7 to focus on heat and energy production and AFW-3 to incorporate a goal for forest-based ethanol production. Suggestion was based on research results presented by Steve Running that indicate forest-based ethanol could be a 30 billion dollar industry nationally. CCS suggested adding potential forest feedstocks into the estimates of feedstocks for AFW-3. The TWG member suggested a specific change of including 250,000 dry tons/yr of forest biomass into AFW-3. This amount is estimated to be currently available annually on a sustainable basis; however it may take 5-10 years to achieve that level through the right incentives. The TWG member proposed shifting some of the biomass under AFW-7 to AFW-3, which would adjust the AFW-7 goal down to 200,000 dry tons/yr.
8. One TWG member suggested an addition to the feasibility section regarding state actions to actively secure federal dollars available for bioenergy production.
9. A TWG member noted that a CCX advisory group of scientists was convened to identify opportunities for sequestration on rangelands. The advisory group recommendations have led to credit contracts on the CCX. The best way to incorporate this new information was discussed. It was decided to include the carbon sequestration rates of improved grazing land management in the text of AFW-1. The TWG member will provide suggested text.
10. AFW-4: TWG member has identified practices under Farm Bill programs that are currently receiving cost share support. MT DEQ put in a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request to the Natural Resources Conservation Service for data on the acres under specific management practices implemented under the farm bill programs. Some information has been obtained from the USDA Farm Services Agency, however TWG members are still awaiting a response to the FOIA request. DEQ will follow up on the status of this request. CCS noted that we will need to obtain this information quickly (within the next week) to be able to incorporate it into the quantification of benefits.
11. AFW-5: CCS reviewed assumptions for quantifying the agriculture portion of the option and reviewed the analysis of the forestry portion. The TWG discussed the assumption that 50% of carbon stocks are lost when forests are converted to developed uses. The estimate is based on a range of percentages considered in other states (30-90%) and conversations with an expert in VT specifically about the 50% number. There was agreement that this is probably a reasonable estimate and if possible, data for the West or Northwest region will be taken into account (pending availability).
12. AFW-7: CCS updated the TWG on the current thinking on the analysis and noted that there are likely overlaps with ES/RCI options related to renewable energy generation, including from biomass. CCS will find out if the biomass feedstocks proposed under this option are covered elsewhere. The TWG should still consider developing cost estimates to include under this option. CCS noted some additional data provided by DEQ on feasibility with regard to fuel costs and facility type.

www.mtclimatechange.us

13. AFW-8: CCS reviewed the quantification of benefits under the two goals for this option. A TWG member will provide a report on an urban forestry project in MT for comparison to CCS estimates. The TWG member noted their experience was also that this type of program is relatively costly with regard to the amount of carbon savings achieved. CCS reviewed assumptions under the restocking goal. Again, a TWG member has some additional information developed for the CCX for comparison, which will be provided to CCS.
14. AFW-9: CCS noted that both forest carbon sequestration and harvested wood products carbon sequestration were quantified under this option. CCS noted a need for an assessment of the cost and potential cost savings. One TWG member suggested including the potential value of carbon credits under a carbon market as part of the carbon savings analysis. CCS noted this has not typically been included in cost analysis of policy options.
15. AFW-10: CCS reviewed the anticipated approach to quantification and indicated their intent to use data from the CORRIM model and cited an approximate GHG savings of 25% from displacement of steel and concrete materials. CCS requested input data from DEQ, which had previously been discussed on a TWG call. DEQ will send data on housing starts and quantity of wood in a typical single-family housing unit. DEQ recalled that their data sources suggest about 7,000 single-family housing starts per year based on trends from 2000-2007; and approximately 15,000 board ft of wood used per house.
16. AFW-11: CCS noted some places where additional information on costs would be helpful for further developing the analysis. CCS needs to know from TWG volunteers where costs will be incurred to implement this option (e.g. increased staffing at state agencies, incentives for in-state food processors, incentives for producers to grow specific crops).
17. AFW-12: CCS reported that initial estimates are tied to reductions in non-organics recycling. Organic wastes still need to be built into the assessment. CCS also noted a need for more information on costs. DEQ can provide some cost information in support of the analysis.
18. CCS discussed next steps, noting that a lot of work will take place off-line over the next few weeks in preparation for the CCAC meeting. CCS encouraged all TWG members to review and provide additional details where needed on the sections for implementation mechanisms, additional benefits and costs, and feasibility issues. The objective is to have a complete draft of the options document complete for review on the next TWG call. Therefore, CCS will need any additional input from the TWG by June 15.

Next steps:

1. Agenda for next TWG call: Review final draft version of the policy options in preparation for the CCAC meeting
2. Next TWG call will be June 22, 10 am - 12 pm mountain time.
3. Next CCAC meeting will be July 9.

**MT AFW Volunteers for Policy Option Development
(Additional volunteers are requested)**

Option #	GHG Reduction Policy Option	Volunteers
AFW-1	Agricultural Soil Carbon Management Programs	T. Peterson; D. Kelsey; R. Bricklemyer; C. Watters, R. Boettcher
AFW-2	Biodiesel Production (incentives for feedstocks and production plants)	C. Watters, D. Kelsey, B. Bahr
AFW-3	Ethanol Production	R. Liebert, C. Watters, J. Blend
AFW-4	Incentives for Maintenance of Conservation Reserve Program (CRP) Acreage	T. Dodge, R. Bricklemyer, L. Saul
AFW-5	Preserve Open Space & Working Lands	L. Whitney, R. Liebert, L. Saul, J Blend
AFW-6	Forest Health Programs for Carbon Management	B. Habeck, N. Sampson, S. Miller
AFW-7	Expanded Use of Forest Biomass Feedstocks for Energy Use	P. Crowley, N. Sampson, S. Miller
AFW-8	Afforestation and Reforestation Programs	N. Sampson, L. Whitney, B. Habeck
AFW-9	Improved Management and Restoration of Existing Stands	L. Whitney, B. Habeck
AFW-10	Expanded Use of Wood Products for Building Materials	B. Bahr, L Whitney
AFW-11	Programs to Promote Local Food & Fiber	L. Saul, R. Liebert, C. Watters, R. Boettcher
AFW-12	Enhanced Solid Waste Recovery & Recycling	P. Crowley, B. Bahr
Contact Information		
Gary Perry	Perrysd35@aol.com	406-282-7477
Ted Dodge	ted.dodge@ncoc.us	406-723-6262
Trudi Peterson	elpranch@hotmail.com	406-374-2244
Dave Kelsey	dave_kelsey2@hotmail.com	406-669-3115
Neil Sampson	RNeilSampson@cs.com	703-924-0773
Ross Bricklemyer	rsb@montana.edu	406-994-5119
Lowell Whitney	lwhitney@mt.gov	406-542-4256
Collin Watters	cwatters@mt.gov	406-444-2402
Sterling Miller	millers@nwf.org	406-721-6705
Jim Evanoff	Jim_Evanoff@nps.gov	406-581-5470
Richard Liebert	wwranch@3rivers.net	406-736-5791
Robert Boettcher	boetrae@ttc-cmc.net	406-378-3243
Lynda Saul	lsaul@mt.gov	406-444-6652
Bill Bahr	bbahr@mt.gov	406-444-7305
Bob Habeck	bhabeck@mt.gov	406-444-5337
Jeff Blend	jblend@mt.gov	406-444-6762
Steve Roe	sroe@pechan.com	916-708-1893
Katie Bickel	kbickel@gmail.com	818-779-7861